The Ninth Art Versus The Tenth Art: Visualizing Conflicting Worldviews Between Comics and Screens

Julian Lawrence
University of British Columbia,
Emily Carr University of Art and Design

ABSTRACT

In this article, I argue that deficient and declining opportunities for art in schools coupled with initiatives to incorporate computer literacy, coding and STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, Mathematics) as priorities forecast a dire future for the comics medium as pedagogical tool. Additionally, one result of the medium’s historical debasement is that most educators are unfamiliar with ways to use comics and cartooning; thus classroom opportunities for students to engage in a medium they love are rare. In this study, I investigate integrating the language of comics into classroom learning strategies and research some of the ways writing/cartooning can help students negotiate conceptions of identity. I wrote a lesson plan that weaved connections between making comics and teaching curriculum, and taught the twenty-five participants sequential narratives through freehand cartooning. This study investigates some of the ways drawing fictional comics can support students’ learning and negotiations of identity in the classroom.

This is a qualitative research project that gathers data in the form of student-generated art and one-on-one audio interviews with three participants. A/r/tography, semiotics, and life-writing inform the study’s progress as I research participants’ understandings through comics. Conceptions of identity and authorship emerge in the participants’ comics, as well as in my own explorations of life-writing.

A class of twenty-five bilingual grade four students participated in this study. Due to time constraints and the large volume of data generated, I narrowed the scope of the study to three participants, thus creating opportunities for more detailed analysis of information. Data tracking was supported by theories of authorship such as l’auteur complet [the complete author] (Groensteen, 2012; Uidhir, 2012) and l’écriture féminine [the feminine writing] (Cixous & Clement, 1986; Sellars, 1996; Taylor, 2014). Deeper analysis of the students’ comics reveals that the perception/drawing/meaning systems (Cohn, 2012) involved with image-making create unconscious (Hancock, 2009; Jung & Franz, 1964) pathways for students to engage and negotiate identity. In this way, they are personally invested in the narratives they create and thus engaged to learn and explore. This engagement is amplified when their works are to be displayed and, especially, printed into booklets as they were in this study.

KEYWORDS: Comics; a/r/tography; semiotics; educational research; cartooning
The knowledge economy keeps subjects dependent on technology and creates conditions that standardize identity for efficient management (Keen & Gloe, 2012; Keen, 2015; Ma, 1997; Marcuse, 1964).

I believe there is a need to decouple from the state’s knowledge economy, which is now structured almost entirely upon digital technology (Hertzog, 2016).

I argue the benefits-versus-harms debate surrounding digital communication in the classroom necessitates the conceptualizing of a balance between real world and virtual world experiences for children (Bindley, 2011; UHLS et al., 2014).

However, studies show that there is no perceived balance because students aged 8-18 spend on average, over seven hours a day, seven days a week on digital media, outside of school (Siedd, 2015; Harris, 2014; UHLS et al., 2014).

I suggest that a deficiency of opportunities for art in schools forecasts a dim future for comics as a pedagogical tool.

Opportunities for art-making appear to be decreasing as schools serve to train a technologically adept labour force of consumers (Noddings, 2007; Snaza, 2016).

The esthetic value of educational activity is often completely ignored perhaps because... esthetic activities are not highly priced in society (Huebner et al., 1999, p. 109).

Studies have found links between educational attainment and arts participation (Rickey-Munday, 2013, p. 89).--- and that some of these links lie in the reflective and collaborative aspects within arts practices...

There are decades of research that establish comics as effective classroom tools--- yet most studies employ forms of comics for reading rather than a medium for writing (Kraven, 2017; Williams, 2018).

A perceived lack of making comics in the classroom is due, in part, to educators being only partially literate in comics language.

Anthropologist Tim Ingold (2013) writes, “So long as it is done by hand, all writing is drawing” (p. 139). Therefore, the freehand cartooning of comics language (Brunetti, 2011; Gronstein, 2007) can be understood as writing.

Reading is the ability to read and write a language (Collins & Biehal, 2002). As such, many scholars, academics, and educators can read comics--- but they can’t write comics.

Thus teachers’ partial-literacy in comics, combined with the knowledge economy’s technological intensifications, can reduce opportunities for freehand cartooning in education.

For example, President Obama called for greater technological literacy among young people in the country---

--- education is continuing to embrace technology at a dramatically accelerated pace, schools are moving swiftly towards the ultimate goal of i/l computing and relying on digital resources for teaching and learning.

(Oray, Jones & Branch, 2017, p. 89).
Furthermore, British Columbia Premier Christy Clark announced in January 2016 that, “IT IS MY GOAL TO MAKE SURE THAT IT DOESN’T JUST BECOME AN OPPORTUNITY FOR EVERY CHILD TO TAKE PART, BUT WE UNEQUALLY MAKE IT MANDATORY FOR EVERY CHILD FROM KINDERGARTEN TO GRADE 12 TO LEARN WHAT CODING IS AND HOW IT WORKS.” (Shaw & Shaw, 2016, para. 3).

Scholar Henry A. Giroux (2010) writes that "Many educators have lost a meaningful language for linking schooling to democracy. They remain convinced that education is now about job training, competitive market advantage, patriotic correctness, and a steady supply of labor for the national security state." (p.33).

The demands of micromanagement in technology (Brunetti, 2011) are subsuming schoolchildren’s developments in free-hand writing and drawing. Continued intensification (Apple, 2009) of digital technology threatens to marginalize and diminish physical and embodied multimodal experiences for students.

Moreover, these don’t address the imbalance between students’ life-world negotiations and screen-based mediations.

Studies find that overexposure to screen-based technologies can have a damaging effect on “preteens’ understanding of nonverbal emotion cues” (Joët et al., 2014, p. 387) and that children’s increased use and exposure to digital screens “thus curtail the face-to-face experiences necessary to master important social skills” (p. 388) such as interacting with people.

This is further supported by studies that point to the importance of nonverbal emotion cue recognition in the development of empathy (Clark, Winkelmann & McIntosh, 2008; Scala-Vitz, 2010; Zaki; Bodner & Ochsner, 2009).

In March 2017, Canada’s Federal Government, under Prime Minister Justin Trudeau, unveiled a budget with increased funding to “grow the number of Canadians equipped with science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM), coding and digital skills in order to:”

“HELP YOUNG CANADIANS GET THE SKILLS AND EXPERIENCE THEY NEED TO START THEIR CAREERS.”

(Government of Canada, 2017).

The demands of micromanagement in technology (Brunetti, 2011) are subsuming schoolchildren’s developments in free-hand writing and drawing. Continued intensification (Apple, 2009) of digital technology threatens to marginalize and diminish physical and embodied multimodal experiences for students.

There are a number of studies that investigate positive implications of screen-based technology in schools (Corgelussen & Pretz, 2016; Kerrodew et al., 2016).

However, these don’t address the imbalance between students’ life-world negotiations and screen-based mediations.

If anything, I contend such studies can contribute to the decline of freehand writing and drawing in schools.

Hey, look at me--I’m uploading content to Facebook for free!

Now to order a new smartphone from Amazon with PayPal.

An increasing number of jobs at all levels require knowledge of STEM and reports have linked K-12 STEM education to continued scientific and economic growth (National Research Council, 2011, p. 2).

Member of the O.S.S.C. Committee.

Thus coding, programming, and computer literacy are increasingly taking precedence over embodied activities such as freehand writing and drawing.

I suggest educators investigate methods to mitigate the perceived imbalance between children’s life-world and virtual-world experiences by reducing exposure to digital devices in elementary schools.

One way that students can negotiate embodied and material practices of identity is to dedicate more school-time to the empathetic cartooning (Brunetti, 2011; Horsman, 2015) of making comics.
Greene (2007) writes, "The practice of comics is, technically and financially speaking, available to everyone" (p. 19). Authorship for students is facilitated by a relative ease of accessibility to the tools of the medium. From these real-world and material encounters, being creates meaning, mediates environment and forms an identity (Bolt, 2007; Greene, 2007; Heidegger, 1962; Irwin & Springgay, 2008; Merleau-Ponty, 2004).

In the fall of 2015 I began a year-long arts-based research study into comics and identity.

Over the course of two months I taught twenty-five bilingual grade four students in Vancouver B.C., Canada how to make comics.

Analysis of the hundreds of student-generated comics and cartoons yields interesting findings.

This study reveals that drawing comics and cartooning by hand are empathetic and embodied experiences (Brunetti, 2011; Horsman, 2013; Swart, 2016) that triangulate perception, cognition and touch (Conn, 2012).

For instance, Anna’s three characters are metaphoric avatars of herself and her family, which I’ll explain later.

I interviewed three random participants six times.

Yes, more art courses and creative things.

Yes, inking is engaging and requires concentration, reflection and focus.

Amm... more art.

Art (Anna, age 9)

I like art.

Stella (age 9)

Daniel (age 9)

Students appear to unconsciously negotiate conceptions of identity through the fictional cartoon characters they create.

They’re all working so quietly on their comics!

Is there anything you would change about school?

Yes, pseudo-rooms are employed to maintain anonymity.

Note: pseudonyms are employed to maintain anonymity.

Is there anything you would change about school?

Umm... more art.
Anna describes Hamy as "vraiment comme dramatique" ["really like dramatic"], and TTOD as "plus calme" ["more calm"]. In terms of her own temperament and relationship with those two characters, Anna says she positions herself "entre le milieu" ["in the middle"]. Employing écriture féminine (Cixous & Clément, 1986) as a lens for analysis opens interesting connections when contextualizing her interview comments with her comics. For instance, Anna situates herself between two main characters who are good friends, which can perhaps be contrasted with her perceptions of living with "deux mères" ["two moms"]. Thus the relationship between Hamy, TTOD, and Jeff suggests perceptual openings into Anna's negotiations of her own identity. I decide to pursue this line of inquiry and organize a sixth and final interview with the three participants almost one year after my classroom visits had ended.

The dynamics between Hamy and TTOD are the polar opposites of each other. For example, in the last panel of Figure 2, TTOD is portrayed playing music on the guitar while simultaneously Hamy, the reader is told, likes to destroy guitars. I suggest the character of Jeff the ant offers Anna metaphoric perspectives into her own experience of living in between two m/others, thus opening opportunities for authorial explorations into social relations. In our final interview together, I ask Anna if her two mothers have different personalities from each other. She replies, "Oui, très différents" ["Yes, very different"]. I continue by asking her, "Alors, est-ce que tu penses que Hamy représente une mère puis TTOD représente l’autre mère puis Jeff te représente au milieu de ces deux la? ["So, do you think Hamy represents one mother, TTOD represents the other mother, and Jeff represents you in-between these two?"] Without hesitation Anna replies with an enthusiastic "Oui! ["Yes!"]

The talking pig-nosed character is, according to Daniel, a self-portrait. This is reinforced by the “rat-tail” of hair visibly sticking out from behind the character’s head below the speech balloon on the left, a characteristic hair style shared by both Daniel and the character in his drawing. This, I suggest, is a Visual Linking Device (Lim, 2004, 2007) that forges a relationship between the author and his cartoon character. In this way, Daniel negotiates identity by assuming features of the other. The pig-like inhuman says in the first speech balloon, "I love pigs." This is followed by a cry of, "Oooooooooooooooo" in the second speech balloon, which Daniel explains is the character whistling. There is a caption situated where the character’s stomach would be, and Daniel writes how very intelligent pigs are. Yet the text assumes a more serious tone when he broaches the subject of eating animals.

In the drawing, Daniel admits to loving bacon and appears to express relief in the somewhat misguided belief that pig meat is not harvested until after the animal dies of old age. In our sixth and last interview, Daniel states, "Si j’étais un fermier et j’avais des cochons je ne l’ai pas tuer (sic) et après prendre leur bacon, parce que si tu fais ça le bacon est plus bon ["If I were a farmer and I had pigs, I would not kill them and then take their bacon, because if you do that the bacon is no longer any good."] The empathetic connection with the other revealed in both Daniel’s cartoon and in our conversation, I suggest, communicates a love and empathy for animals, nature, and the inhuman.
On page 3 of her six-page story, Stella portrays the moment her character Rosette opens an insulting note tossed at her by two bullies in class. In Panel 2, the point-of-view shifts, thus directing the reader to empathetically and metaphorically become Rosette. The author (Stella, that is) invites the reader to reciprocally share in the experience of narrator-monstrator-reciter (Groensteen, 2007), and thus negotiate identity through the character’s perspective. In fact, the author and the reader are sharing the eyes of the character: Rosette’s striped sleeves are now the arms of the reader; the hands that grasp the insulting note are also those of the reader; and the eyes reading the note are those of the reader now as well. The reader is Rosette, and Rosette is the reader... an empathetic symbiosis and new indivitrio of author, character, and reader. Stella claims comics authorship by tearing down the fourth wall. In this way she pays attention to the liminal space between writer and reader whereby the author writes “toward the other” (Sellers, 1996, p. 19) and invites the reader into the narrative through a multimodal hybridity of character design, panel composition, non-verbal emotion cues, and camera angles (Groensteen, 2007, 2013; Lim, 2007; Uhls et al., 2014; Williams, 2008).

I asked Stella, in our last interview, “Est-ce que tu voulais que le lecteur pense pour un instant qu’il peut devenir Rosette avec un dessin comme ça? [“Did you want the reader to think for a moment that they can become Rosette with a drawing like this?”] She replied, “J’ai pas trop penser a faire un dessin comme ça” [“I didn’t really think too much about doing a drawing like that.”] I contend Stella is, in this comic, unconsciously claiming authorship by attending “to the gaps” (Sellers, 1996, p. 16) and communicating vividly with the other.
A growing divergence between life-world and virtual-world experience signifies conflicting worldviews whereby an intensification of digital technology in schools contributes to the moribund condition of curriculum studies and analog existence.

This visual essay explores some of the pedagogical implications of the technopoly. There are, however, several other fields impacted by growing technology; these include, but are not limited to, various environmental and health concerns.

RESEARCHING A CURRICULUM THAT INCORPORATES THE FREEHAND WRITING AND CARTOONING OF THE COMICS MEDIUM IS A UNIQUE APPROACH TO LEVEL THE IMBALANCE.

IN AN INTERVIEW WITH JAN BASTENS (2013), BART BEATY SAYS THAT, “THERE MUST BE A DEPARTMENT OF COMICS STUDIES” (P.181).

This department is slow to materialize due to a “general unfamiliarity with the medium” (Udhrir, 2012, p. 50). Currently, comics is a nomad science (Deleuze & Guattari, 2007) that takes up temporary residence in various departments at the margins of academia.

Words and pictures by Julian Lawrence, University of British Columbia & Emily Carr University of Art and Design, Julian@janlawrence.net.

Thank you to Rita Ito, Sandone Han, Ching-Chui Lin, Tsun Can, and Kim Stewart for your assistance and inspiration.

A special thank you to the staff, administration, teachers and students at Ucole Francaise in Vancouver.

I gratefully acknowledge the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada for their generous support of this research.

Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada  Conseil de recherches en sciences humaines du Canada.

In an interview with Jan Bastens (2013), Bart Beatty says that, "There must be a department of comics studies." (p. 181).

This department is slow to materialize due to a "general unfamiliarity with the medium" (Udhrir, 2012, p. 50). Currently, comics is a nomad science (Deleuze & Guattari, 2007) that takes up temporary residence in various departments at the margins of academia.

"The comics world will be able to overcome the historical biases against comics and legitimize them as art" (p. 47).

With experience with comics has created understandings into some of the complexities of second language acquisition.

"When asked how she felt about the anthology, Anna said: "I felt proud and I felt proud for the other people."

Me, in grade four.

"Oh, I get it now... His name is Asterix because it sounds like Asterisks!"

Comics helped me learn French, but as a British-Canadian citizen in Quebec, I was looked upon as an other.

My third language of comics has, in ways similar to my Anglophone experience in Quebec, been vilified and debased by the dominant culture. However, comics scholar Bart Beatty (2012) writes that,

"...the comics world will be able to overcome the historical biases against comics and legitimize them as art." (p. 47).

In an interview with Jan Bastens (2013), Beatty says that, "There must be a department of comics studies." (p. 181).

This department is slow to materialize due to a "general unfamiliarity with the medium" (Udhiri, 2012, p. 50). Currently, comics is a nomad science (Deleuze & Guattari, 2007) that takes up temporary residence in various departments at the margins of academia.

"Oh, I get it now... His name is Asterix because it sounds like Asterisks!"

With experience with comics has created understandings into some of the complexities of second language acquisition.

"When asked how she felt about the anthology, Anna said: "I felt proud and I felt proud for the other people."

Me, in grade four.

"Oh, I get it now... His name is Asterix because it sounds like Asterisks!"

Comics helped me learn French, but as a British-Canadian citizen in Quebec, I was looked upon as an other.
References


